arXiv:gr-qc/0011103v1 28 Nov 2000

Fourth–Order Ricci Gravity

A. Borowiec[a], M. Francaviglia[b] and V.I. Smirichinski[c]

[a] Institute of Theoretical Physics, Wrocław University, Poland
[b] Departimento di Matematica, Unversitá di Torino, Italy
[c] Joint Institute for Nulclear Research, Dubna, Moscow Region, Russia.

Abstract

The Euler-Lagrange equations of motion for the most general Ricci type gravitational Lagrangians are derived by means of a purely metric formalism.

Einstein metrics are extremals of the Einstein-Hilbert purely metric variational problem. It is known that the non-linear Einstein-Hilbert type Lagrangians $f(R)\sqrt{g}$, where f is a smooth function of one real variable and R is the scalar curvature of a metric g [1], lead either to fourth order equations for g which are not equivalent to Einstein equations unless $f(R) = R - c$ (linear case) or to the appearance of additional matter fields.

Fourth-derivative theories of gravity enjoy better renormalizability properties then standard gravity based on the Hilbert-Einstein Lagrangian density. Besides, higher-order theories are of interest in cosmology, since they do contain every vacuum solution of GR (including Schwarzschild solution). Linear Ricci type Lagrangians have been studied in this context by many authors (see e.g. [1, 7-10] and references therein).

In the present note we are going to use variational decomposition techniques (see e.g. [4]) in order to obtain equations of motion for the most general (nonlinear) Lagrangian densities of the Ricci type (see formula (6) below) by means of a purely metric formalism. As an intermediate step one performs the variational decomposition in the framework of the so-called Palatini formalism, i.e. keeping a metric and a (symmetric) connection as independent variables [2-6].

In the sequel we shall use lower case letters $r^{\alpha}_{\beta\mu\nu}$ and $r_{\beta\nu} = r^{\alpha}_{\beta\alpha\nu}$ to denote the Riemann and Ricci tensor of an arbitrary (symmetric) connection Γ:

$$\begin{aligned} r^{\alpha}_{\beta\mu\nu} &= r^{\alpha}_{\beta\mu\nu}(\Gamma) = \partial_{\mu}\Gamma^{\alpha}_{\beta\nu} - \partial_{\nu}\Gamma^{\alpha}_{\beta\mu} + \Gamma^{\alpha}_{\sigma\mu}\Gamma^{\sigma}_{\beta\nu} - \Gamma^{\alpha}_{\sigma\nu}\Gamma^{\sigma}_{\beta\mu} \\ r_{\mu\nu} &= r_{\mu\nu}(\Gamma) = r^{\alpha}_{\mu\alpha\nu} \end{aligned} \tag{1}$$

i.e. without assuming that Γ is the Levi-Civita connection of a metric g. We shall assume that space-time is four-dimensional but our results will be valid in any dimension $n \geq 3$.

As it is also known, the linear "first order" Lagrangian $r\sqrt{g}$, where $r = r(g, \Gamma) = g^{\alpha\beta} r_{\alpha\beta}(\Gamma)$ is a scalar concomitant of a metric g and a linear (symmetric) connection Γ, [2] leads to separate equations for g and Γ which turn out to be equivalent to the Einstein equations for g (so-called Palatini principle, c.f. [1-4]). In other words, the first-order metric-affine Lagrangian $r\sqrt{g}$ and the purely metric Einstein-Hilbert Lagrangian $R\sqrt{g}$ are equivalent in the sense that they lead to the same class of solutions, namely to vacuum Einstein metrics.

---

[1] One simply writes $\sqrt{g}$ for $\sqrt{|\mathtt{det}g|}$.

[2] Now, the scalar $r(g, \Gamma) = g^{\alpha\beta} r_{\alpha\beta}(\Gamma)$ is no longer the scalar curvature, since Γ is no longer the Levi-Civita connection of g.

Unlike in the purely metric case, an equivalence with General Relativity also holds for non-linear gravitational Lagrangians

$$L_f(g,\Gamma) = \sqrt{g}\, f(r) \tag{2}$$

(parametrized by the real function f of one variable) when they are considered within the first-order Palatini formalism. More exactly, it was shown [6] that (with the notable exception of some special non-generic choice of the function f) we always obtain Einstein equations as gravitational field equations. This property of Einstein equations was called *universality.*

The universality property holds also true for "Ricci squared" non-linear Lagrangians

$$\hat{L}_f(g,\Gamma) = \sqrt{g}\, f(s) \tag{3}$$

where $s = s(g,\Gamma) = g^{\alpha\mu}g^{\beta\nu}r_{(\alpha\beta)}r_{(\mu\nu)}$ and $r_{(\mu\nu)} = r_{(\mu\nu)}(\Gamma)$ is the symmetric part of the Ricci tensor of Γ (see [3]). (Thereafter round brackets around indices denote symmetrization). But in this case, besides the Einstein equations, one obtains algebraic constraints which can be interpreted as an almost-product or an almost-complex structure on the space-time manifold [2]. Moreover, which one of these two can be realised depends on the sign of a cosmological constant which is introduced within the calculations (see [3] for details).

Let us consider a $(1,1)$ tensor valued concomitant of a metric g and a linear torsionless connection Γ defined by

$$S^\mu_\nu \equiv S^\mu_\nu(g,\Gamma) = g^{\mu\lambda}r_{(\lambda\nu)}(\Gamma) \tag{4}$$

One can use it to define a family of scalar concomitants of the Ricci type

$$s_k = \mathtt{tr} S^k \tag{5}$$

for $k = 1,\ldots,4$. We can in fact eliminate the higher order Ricci scalars s_k with $k > 4$ by using the characteristic polynomial equation for the 4×4 matrix S (see [5]). One immediately recognizes that $r \equiv s_1 = \mathtt{tr}S$ and $s \equiv s_2 = \mathtt{tr}S^2$.

The most general family of non-linear Ricci-type gravitational Lagrangians in four-dimensions, i.e.:

$$L_F(g,\Gamma) = \sqrt{g}\, F(s_1,s_2,s_3,s_4) \tag{6}$$

is thence parametrized by a smooth real-valued function F of 4-variables. This includes the Lagrangians (2) and (3) as particular cases.

As already mentioned above we start with the "Palatini variational principle", i.e. we choose a metric g and a symmetric connection Γ as independent dynamical variables. Variation of L_F gives then

$$\delta L_F = \sqrt{g}\,\delta_g F - \frac{1}{2}F g_{\alpha\beta}\,\delta g^{\alpha\beta} + \sqrt{g}\,\delta_\Gamma F \tag{7}$$

where obviously $\delta F = \sum_{k=1}^{4} F'_k \, \delta s_k$ and $F'_k = \frac{\partial F}{\partial s_k}$. We see at once that

$$\delta_g s_k = k \, \mathtt{tr}(S^{k-1} \delta_g S) = k \, (S^{k-1})^{\sigma}_{\alpha} \, r_{(\beta\sigma)} \, \delta g^{\alpha\beta}$$

which is clear from $\delta s_k = k \, \mathtt{tr}(S^{k-1} \delta S)$. Accordingly one has

$$\delta_g F = \mathcal{F}^{\sigma}_{\alpha} \, r_{(\beta\sigma)} \delta g^{\alpha\beta} \tag{8}$$

where for simplicity we have introduced a $(1,1)$ tensor field concomitant

$$\mathcal{F} = \sum_{k=1}^{4} k \, F'_k \, S^{k-1}$$

In a similar way one calculates

$$\delta_\Gamma F = \mathcal{F}^{\alpha}_{\sigma} \, g^{\sigma\beta} \, \delta r_{(\alpha\beta)} \equiv \mathcal{F}^{\alpha\beta} \, \delta r_{(\alpha\beta)} \tag{9}$$

where, as usual, the metric g has been used to rise and lower indices. Moreover, as it can be easily checked by a direct calculation, the (0,2) tensor field

$$\mathcal{F}^{\alpha\beta} \equiv \mathcal{F}^{\alpha}_{\sigma} \, g^{\sigma\beta}$$

is already symmetric (see [5]).

Substituting (8) and (9) into equation (7) gives

$$\delta L_F = \sqrt{g} \, [\mathcal{F}^{\sigma}_{\alpha} \, r_{(\beta\sigma)} - \frac{1}{2} F g_{\alpha\beta}] \, \delta g^{\alpha\beta} - \sqrt{g} \, \mathcal{F}^{\alpha\beta} \, \delta r_{(\alpha\beta)} \tag{10}$$

Now, taking into account the so-called Palatini formula

$$\delta r_{(\alpha\beta)} = \nabla_\mu \delta\Gamma^{\mu}_{\alpha\beta} - \nabla_{(\alpha} \delta\Gamma^{\sigma}_{\beta)\sigma}$$

∇_α being the covariant derivative with respect to Γ and performing the "covariant" Leibniz rule one gets the variational decomposition formula under the form

$$\delta L_F \;=\; \sqrt{g} \, [\mathcal{F}^{\sigma}_{\alpha} \, r_{(\beta\sigma)} - \frac{1}{2} F g_{\alpha\beta}] \, \delta g^{\alpha\beta} - \nabla_\nu \, [\sqrt{g} \, (\mathcal{F}^{\alpha\beta} \, \delta^{\nu}_{\lambda} - \mathcal{F}^{\nu\alpha} \, \delta^{\beta}_{\lambda})] \, \delta\Gamma^{\lambda}_{\alpha\beta} + \mathbf{div} \tag{11}$$

which splits δL_F into the Euler-Lagrange part and a boundary term generically denoted by **div** since we shall not exploit its explicit form here. The boundary term, however, plays an essential role during the calculation of a canonical energy momentum complex (see e.g. [4]). This will be therefore investigated in more details elsewhere.

Accordingly, the Euler-Lagrange field equations ensuing from the Palatini formalism read as follows

$$\mathcal{F}^{\sigma}_{(\alpha} \, r_{(\beta)\sigma)} = \frac{1}{2} F \, g_{\alpha\beta} \tag{12}$$

$$\nabla_\nu \, [\sqrt{g} \, \mathcal{F}^{\alpha\beta}] = 0. \tag{13}$$

Their analysis have been already performed in [5]. Also for this case the universality of Einstein equations takes place.

Our goal in the present note is to calculate the Euler-Lagrange equations in the purely metric framework, i.e. assuming $\Gamma^{\lambda}_{\alpha\beta}$ to be the Levi-Civita connection of g. For this purpose one has to continue our calculations with $\delta\Gamma^{\lambda}_{\alpha\beta}$ replaced in (11) by

$$\delta_g\Gamma^{\lambda}_{\alpha\beta} = \frac{1}{2}g^{\lambda\sigma}(\nabla_\alpha\delta g_{\beta\sigma} + \nabla_\beta\delta g_{\alpha\sigma} - \nabla_\sigma\delta g_{\alpha\beta}).$$

For example, transvecting the first term above with the second part of (11) one calculates:

$$\nabla_\nu\left(\sqrt{g}\left([\mathcal{F}^{\alpha\beta}\,\delta^\nu_\lambda - \mathcal{F}^{\nu\alpha}\,\delta^\beta_\lambda]\right)\frac{1}{2}g^{\lambda\sigma}\nabla_\alpha\delta g_{\beta\sigma} = \mathbf{div} - \frac{1}{2}\nabla_\alpha\nabla_\nu\left(\sqrt{g}\left([\mathcal{F}^{\alpha\beta}\,\delta^\nu_\lambda - \mathcal{F}^{\nu\alpha}\,\delta^\beta_\lambda]\right)\delta g_{\beta\sigma}$$

Similar calculations for the two remaining terms give rise finally to the fourth-order Euler-Lagrange equations for the Lagrangian densities (6) which, after some calculations, can be presented in the following form:

$$\frac{1}{2}\Box\mathcal{F}^{\alpha\beta} + \frac{1}{2}g^{\alpha\beta}\nabla_\sigma\nabla_\rho\mathcal{F}^{\sigma\rho} - \nabla_\sigma\nabla^{(\alpha}\mathcal{F}^{\beta)\sigma} - \frac{1}{2}g^{\alpha\beta}F + \mathcal{F}^{\sigma(\alpha}R^{\beta)}_{\sigma} = 0 \tag{14}$$

where $\Box$ denotes the d'Alambertian (or Laplace-Beltrami) second order differential operator and $R_{\mu\nu}$ is the Ricci tensor of g. Since $\mathcal{F}^{\alpha\beta}$ depends on the second-order derivatives of g equation (14) provides a fourth-order non-linear operator acting on g.

Example 1. Take $F = f(R)$. Then $\mathcal{F}^{\alpha\beta} = f'(R)g^{\alpha\beta}$ and (14) yields the well-known result

$$[g^{\alpha\beta}\Box - \nabla^\alpha\nabla^\beta]f'(R) - \frac{1}{2}f(R)g^{\alpha\beta} + f'(R)R^{\alpha\beta} = 0 \tag{15}$$

Example 2. Take $F = f(R_{\mu\nu}R^{\mu\nu})$; then $\mathcal{F}^{\alpha\beta} = 2f'(R_{\mu\nu}R^{\mu\nu})\,R^{\alpha\beta}$. In this case (14) gives

$$\Box(f'R^{\alpha\beta}) + g^{\alpha\beta}\nabla_\sigma\nabla_\rho(f'R^{\sigma\rho}) - 2\nabla_\sigma\nabla^{(\alpha}(f'R^{\beta)\sigma}) - \frac{1}{2}f(R_{\mu\nu}R^{\mu\nu})g^{\alpha\beta} + 2f'R^{\sigma(\alpha}R^{\beta)}_{\sigma} = 0, \tag{16}$$

which for the linear case $f' = 1$ reduces to

$$\Box R^{\alpha\beta} + g^{\alpha\beta}\nabla_\sigma\nabla_\rho R^{\sigma\rho} - 2\nabla_\sigma\nabla^{(\alpha}(R^{\beta)\sigma}) - \frac{1}{2}g^{\alpha\beta}R_{\mu\nu}R^{\mu\nu} + 2R^{\sigma(\alpha}R^{\beta)}_{\sigma} = 0. \tag{17}$$

This can be recasted (using Bianchi identities) as follows (compare [9]):

$$\Box R^{\alpha\beta} + \frac{1}{2}g^{\alpha\beta}\Box R - \nabla^\alpha\nabla^\beta R - \frac{1}{2}g^{\alpha\beta}R_{\mu\nu}R^{\mu\nu} + 2R^{\beta\sigma\alpha\rho}R_{\sigma\rho} = 0. \tag{18}$$

Acknowledgment

This research was supported by the Bogolyubov-Infeld project and the Polish Committee for Scientific Research (KBN): grant 2 P03B 144 19 .

References

1. D. Barraco and V.H. Hamity, Gen. Rel. Grav. **31**, 213 (1999).
2. A. Borowiec, M. Ferraris, M. Francaviglia and I. Volovich, J. Math. Phys. **40**, 3446 (1999).
3. A. Borowiec, M. Ferraris, M. Francaviglia and I. Volovich, Class. Quantum Grav. **15**, 43 (1998).
4. A. Borowiec and M. Francaviglia, *Alternative Lagrangians for Einstein metrics*, in: Proc. Current Topics in Mathematical Cosmology, Int. Sem. Math. Cosmol. Potsdam 1998, eds. M. Rainer and H.-J. Schmidt, WSPC, (Singapore,1998) p.361.
5. A. Borowiec, *Nonlinear Lagrangians of the Ricci type*, Rep. Math. Phys. – in press, gr-qc/9906043 (2000).
6. M. Ferraris, M. Francaviglia and I. Volovich, Class. Quantum Grav. **11**, 1505 (1994).
7. M. Ferraris, M. Francaviglia and G. Magnano, Class. Quantum Grav, **5**, L95 (1988).
8. G. Magnano, M. Ferraris and M. Francaviglia, Gen. Rel. Grav. **19**, 465 (1987).
9. L. Querella, *Variational Principles and Cosmological Models in Higher-Order Gravity*, Doctoral dissertation, gr-qc/9902044 (1999).
10. K. S. Stelle, Gen. Rel. Grav. **9**, 353 (1978).